

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF OKLAHOMA**

State of Oklahoma, et al.,)	
)	
)	05-CV-0329 GKF-SAJ
Plaintiffs,)	
v.)	<u>DEFENDANTS' SUPPLEMENTAL</u>
)	<u>BRIEF IN SUPPORT OF</u>
Tyson Foods, Inc., et al.,)	<u>JOINT MOTION TO</u>
)	<u>ENFORCE SCHEDULING ORDERS</u>
Defendants.)	
)	

Defendants jointly moved this Court on September 15, 2008 for an Order enforcing the Court's deadlines for expert disclosures under the Scheduling Orders. (Dkt. No. 1759.) As described in Defendants' Reply (Dkt. No. 1767), after service of the Motion, Plaintiffs served five additional expert "errata," four of which were prompted by a first errata of Dr. Bernard Engel, on whose work many of Plaintiffs' experts rely. The Court heard oral argument on October 8, 2008 and has taken the Motion under advisement. (Dkt. No. 1769.)

On October 17, 2008, Plaintiffs served Defendants with a new (second) errata for Dr. Engel, a copy of which is attached as Exhibit A. Plaintiffs did not produce, or even offer to produce, Dr. Engel's file materials that underlie his second errata.

Counsel's cover letter to Dr. Engel's new errata asserts that it corrects a single mistake – a column of numbers regarding observed P loads that "were stated incorrectly" on Table 10.1 – which then purportedly affected multiple tables and figures. (Ex. A at 1.) In fact, Dr. Engel's latest errata changes *calculations*. If the underlying error was simply a misstatement of numbers in Table 10.1, there would be no changes to anything in the original report or first errata aside from Table 10.1 itself. Instead, Dr. Engel modifies four additional tables and figures that involve calculations of the comparisons between observed P loads and predicted / modeled P loads and

daily P loads at various locations. It appears that Dr. Engel has performed new calculations, without explanation and without providing any back-up file materials.

Plaintiffs' service of yet another new errata – particularly one by Dr. Engel – further supports Defendants' request that the Court order Plaintiffs to stop supplementing and bolstering their expert opinions, at least without leave of the Court. In addition, the new errata provides yet more support for Defendants' argument that Plaintiffs' continued alternation of their experts' reports directly results in continued losses of Defendants' time, effort, and money.

The Court should grant Defendants relief from the prejudice caused by Plaintiffs' repeated failures to abide by the Court's expert deadlines, and should strike all of Plaintiffs' late-produced expert reports.

Respectfully submitted,

Rhodes, Hieronymus, Jones, Tucker & Gable, PLLC

BY: /s/ John H. Tucker
JOHN H. TUCKER, OBA #9110
THERESA NOBLE HILL, OBA #19119
100 W. Fifth Street, Suite 400 (74103-4287)
P.O. Box 21100
Tulsa, Oklahoma 74121-1100
Telephone: 918/582-1173
Facsimile: 918/592-3390

And

DELMAR R. EHRICH
BRUCE JONES
KRISANN C. KLEIBACKER LEE
FAEGRE & BENSON LLP
2200 Wells Fargo Center
90 South Seventh Street
Minneapolis, Minnesota 55402
Telephone: 612/766-7000
Facsimile: 612/766-1600
ATTORNEYS FOR CARGILL, INC. AND CARGILL
TURKEY PRODUCTION, LLC

BY: /s/Erin W. Thompson, ABA #2005250

(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)

ERIN WALKER THOMPSON, Arkansas Bar No.
2005250

KUTAK ROCK LLP

The Three Sisters Building

214 West Dickson Street

Fayetteville, AR 72701-5221

Telephone: (479) 973-4200

Facsimile: (479) 973-0007

-AND-

STEPHEN L. JANTZEN, OBA # 16247

PATRICK M. RYAN, OBA #7864

PAULA M. BUCHWALD, OBA #20464

RYAN, WIALEY & COLDIRON, P.C.

119 N. Robinson

900 Robinson Renaissance

Oklahoma City, OK 73102

Telephone: (405) 239-6040

Facsimile: (405) 239-6766

E-Mail: sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com

-AND

THOMAS C. GREEN, ESQ.

MARK D. HOPSON, ESQ.

TIMOTHY K. WEBSTER, ESQ.

JAY T. JORGENSEN, ESQ.

GORDON D. TODD, ESQ.

SIDLEY AUSTIN LLP

1501 K Street, N.W.

Washington, D.C. 20005-1401

Telephone: (202) 736-8000

Facsimile: (202) 736-8711

**ATTORNEYS FOR TYSON FOODS, INC.;
TYSON POULTRY, INC.; TYSON CHICKEN,
INC; AND COBB-VANTRESS, INC.**

BY: /s/ A. Scott McDaniel
(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)
A. SCOTT MCDANIEL, OBA#16460
CHRIS A. PAUL, OBA #14416
NICOLE LONGWELL, OBA #18771
PHILIP D. HIXON, OBA #19121
McDaniel, Hixon, Longwell & Acord, PLLC
320 S. Boston Avenue
Suite 700
Tulsa, OK 74103
-AND-
SHERRY P. BARTLEY, AR BAR #79009
MITCHELL WILLIAMS, SELIG,
GATES & WOODYARD, PLLC
425 W. Capitol Avenue, Suite 1800
Little Rock, AR 72201
ATTORNEYS FOR PETERSON FARMS, INC.

BY: /s/ R. Thomas Lay
(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)
R. THOMAS LAY, OBA #5297
KERR, IRVINE, RHODES & ABLES
201 Robert S. Kerr Ave., Suite 600
Oklahoma City, OK 73102
-AND-
JENNIFER S. GRIFFIN
LATHROP & GAGE, L.C.
314 East High Street
Jefferson City, MO 65101
**ATTORNEYS FOR WILLOW BROOK
FOODS, INC.**

BY: /s/ Randall E. Rose
(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)
RANDALL E. ROSE, OBA #7753
GEORGE W. OWENS, ESQ.
OWENS LAW F P.C.
234W. 13 Street
Tulsa, OK 74119
-AND-
JAMES MARTIN GRAVES, ESQ.
GARY V. WEEKS, ESQ.
BASSETT LAW FIRM
POB 3618
Fayetteville, AR 72702-3618
**ATTORNEYS FOR GEORGE'S, INC. AND
GEORGE'S FARMS, INC.**

BY: /s/ John R. Elrod
(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)
JOHN R. ELROD
VICKI BRONSON, OBA #20574
BRUCE WAYNE FREEMAN
CONNER & WINTERS, L.L.P.
100 W. Central Street, Suite 200
Fayetteville, AR 72701
ATTORNEYS FOR SIMMONS FOODS, INC.

BY: /s/ Robert P. Redemann
(SIGNED BY FILING ATTORNEY WITH
PERMISSION)
ROBERT P. REDEMANN, OBA #7454
LAWRENCE W. ZERINGUE, ESQ.
DAVID C. SENGHER, OBA #18830
PERRINE, MCGIVERN, REDEMANN, REID,
BARRY &
TAYLOR, P.L.L.C.
Post Office Box 1710
Tulsa, OK 74101-1710
-AND-

ROBERT E. SANDERS
STEPHEN WILLIAMS
YOUNG, WILLIAMS, HENDERSON &
FUSILIER
Post Office Box 23059
Jackson, MS 39225-3059
**ATTORNEYS FOR CAL-MAINE FARMS,
INC. AND CAL-MAINE FOODS, INC.**

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that on the 20th day of October, 2008, I electronically transmitted the attached document to the Clerk of Court using the ECF System for filing and transmittal of a Notice of Electronic Filing to the following ECF registrants:

W. A. Drew Edmondson, Attorney General	drew_edmondson@oag.state.ok.us
Kelly Hunter Burch, Assistant Attorney General	kelly_burch@oag.state.ok.us
J. Trevor Hammons, Assistant Attorney General	trevor_hammons@oag.state.ok.us
Robert D. Singletary	Robert_singletary@oag.state.ok.us
Daniel Lennington, Assistant Attorney General	Daniel.lennington@oag.ok.gov

Melvin David Riggs	driggs@riggsabney.com
Richard T. Garren	rgarren@riggsabney.com
Sharon K. Weaver	sweaver@riggsabney.com
David P. Page	dpage@riggsabney.com
Riggs Abney Neal Turpen Orbison & Lewis	

Robert Allen Nance	rnance@riggsabney.com
Dorothy Sharon Gentry	sgentry@riggsabney.com
Riggs Abney	

Louis W. Bullock	lbullock@mkblaw.net
Robert M. Blakemore	rblakemore@mkblaw.net
Miller Keffer & Bullock	

William H. Narwold	bnarwold@motleyrice.com
Elizabeth C. Ward	lward@motleyrice.com
Frederick C. Baker	fbaker@motleyrice.com
Lee M. Heath	lheath@motleyrice.com
Elizabeth Claire Xidis	cxidis@motleyrice.com
Motley Rice	

COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS

Stephen L. Jantzen	sjantzen@ryanwhaley.com
Paula M. Buchwald	pbuchwald@ryanwhaley.com
Ryan, Whaley & Coldiron, P.C.	

Mark D. Hopson
Jay Thomas Jorgensen
Timothy K. Webster
Gordon D. Todd
Sidley Austin LLP

mhopson@sidley.com
jjorgensen@sidley.com
twebster@sidley.com
gtodd@sidley.com

Michael R. Bond
Erin W. Thompson
LLP

michael.bond@kutakrock.com
erin.thompson@kutakrock.com Kutack Rock

**COUNSEL FOR TYSON FOODS, INC., TYSON POULTRY, INC., TYSON CHICKEN, INC.,
AND COBB-VANTRESS, INC.**

R. Thomas Lay
Kerr, Irvine, Rhodes & Ables

rtl@kiralaw.com

Jennifer S. Griffin
Lathrop & Gage, L.C.

jgriffin@lathropgage.com

COUNSEL FOR WILLOW BROOK FOODS, INC.

Robert P. Redemann
Lawrence W. Zeringue
David C. Senger
Perrine, McGivern, Redemann, Reid, Berry & Taylor, PLLC

rredemann@pmrlaw.net
lzingue@pmrlaw.net
dsenger@pmrlaw.net

Robert E. Sanders
E. Stephen Williams
Young Williams P.A.

rsanders@youngwilliams.com
steve.williams@youngwilliams.com

COUNSEL FOR CAL-MAINE FOODS, INC. AND CAL-MAINE FARMS, INC.

George W. Owens
Randall E. Rose
The Owens Law Firm, P.C.

gwo@owenslawfirmmpc.com
rer@owenslawfirmmpc.com

James M. Graves
Gary V. Weeks
Paul E. Thompson, Jr.
Woody Bassett
K.C. Dupps Tucker

jgraves@bassettlawfirm.com

Bassett Law Firm

COUNSEL FOR GEORGE'S INC. AND GEORGE'S FARMS, INC.

John R. Elrod
Vicki Bronson
Bruce W. Freeman
Conner & Winters, LLLP

jelrod@cwlaw.com
vbronson@cwlaw.com
bfreeman@cwlaw.com

COUNSEL FOR SIMMONS FOODS, INC.

A. Scott McDaniel
Nicole M. Longwell
Philip D. Hixon

smcdaniel@mhla-law.com
nlongwell@mhla-law.com
phixon@mhla-law.com

Craig Mirkes
McDaniel, Hixon, Longwell & Acord, PLLC
Sherry P. Bartley
Mitchell Williams Selig Gates & Woodyard
COUNSEL FOR PETERSON FARMS, INC.

cmirkes@mhla-law.com

sbartley@mwsqw.com

Michael D. Graves
Dale Kenyon Williams, Jr.
COUNSEL FOR CERTAIN POULTRY GROWERS

mgraves@hallestill.com

kwilliams@hallestill.com

Mia Vahlberg
**COUNSEL FOR NATIONAL CHICKEN COUNCIL,
U.S. POULTRY & EGG ASSOCIATION AND NATIONAL
TURKEY FEDERATION**

mvahlberg@gablelaw.com

Adam J. Siegel
James T. Banks

ajsiegel@hhlaw.com

jtbanks@hhlaw.com

John D. Russell
ATTORNEYS FOR ARKANSAS FARM BUREAU FEDERATION

jrussell@fellerssnider.com

Barry G. Reynolds
**ATTORNEYS FOR AMERICAN FARM BUREAU FEDERATION
AND NATIONAL CATTLEMEN'S BEEF ASSOCIATION**

Reynolds@titushillis.com

Jessica E. Rainey
**ATTORNEYS FOR AMERICAN FARM BUREAU FEDERATION
AND NATIONAL CATTLEMEN'S BEEF ASSOCIATION**

jrainey@titushillis.com

M. Richard Mullins
**ATTORNEYS FOR TEXAS FARM BUREAU,
TEXAS CATTLE FEEDERS ASSOCIATION,
TEXAS PORK PRODUCERS ASSOCIATION, AND
TEXAS ASSOCIATION OF DAIRYMEN**

Richard.mullins@mcafeetaft.com

William A. Waddell, Jr.

waddell@fec.net

I also hereby certify that I served the attached documents by United States Postal Service, proper postage paid, on the following who are not registered participants of the ECF System:

C. Miles Tolbert
Secretary of the Environment
State of Oklahoma
3800 North Classen
Oklahoma City, OK 73118
COUNSEL FOR PLAINTIFFS

Charles L. Moulton
Arkansas Natural Resources Commission
323 Center Street
Suite 200
Little Rock, AR 72206

s/ John H. Tucker